State Historic Preservation Grants

Selection Criteria

# Advisory Council Scoring Guidelines

# All applicants *must* meet Criteria One through Three. Criterion Four through Ten are used to rate and rank each project, using a competitive numerical scoring system. The Advisory Council will evaluate each project by these criteria and assign points. The highest scoring projects will receive funding. The criteria will be weighted as follows:

Criteria 1- 3: Not Weighted—*All projects must meet these criteria*.

Criterion 4: 10 Points Possible

Criterion 5: 2 Points Possible

Criterion 6: 4 Points Possible

Criterion 7: 2 Points Possible

Criterion 8: 1 Point Possible (completed by staff)

Criterion 9: 1 Point Possible (completed by staff)

Criterion 10: 1 Point Possible

**A brief explanation follows for each criterion. Every project *must* meet the first three criteria.**

Criterion 1: **PROPERTY MUST BE OWNED BY A NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATION OR A POLITICAL SUBDIVISION OF THE STATE**

Non-profit organizations must provide proof that they are tax-exempt. Internal Revenue Service 501(c)(3) certification is preferred. State agencies are not eligible. Buildings owned by non-profit development corporations are ineligible if the property is being developed for a commercial, income-producing use. Work on income-producing sections of buildings owned by a non-profit organization is ineligible.

Criterion 2: **PROPERTY MUST BE LISTED ON OR ELIGIBLE FOR LISTING IN THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES**

Buildings can be listed either individually or as a contributing resource in a National Register Historic District. If you do not know if your property is listed in the National Register, call the Division for Historic Preservation at 828-3213. Properties not listed in the National Register will be evaluated for National Register eligibility at the time the grant applications are reviewed. Existing or in-process National Register designation may become a positive selection factor in instances where applications compete equally in the other grant criteria.

Criterion 3: **APPLICANT MUST MATCH THE GRANT WITH CASH ON NO LESS THAN A ONE-TO-ONE BASIS**

The applicant can apply for no more than 50% of the total project cost, up to a maximum of $20,000. The applicant's matching share must be in cash and must be in-hand at the time the application is submitted. Projects may utilize donated labor and materials, but these cannot be counted towards the match. State funds are not eligible for use as match, but Federal funds may be used.

The following criteria are **WEIGHTED:**

Criterion 4: **PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO PROJECTS THAT BEST PRESERVE HISTORIC BUILDING FEATURES (10 points possible)**

A project must contribute to preserving the features of the building which make it eligible for the National Register. All project work must meet the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation*, which are included in Appendix 4.

Grants may be awarded in three categories of preservation work:

**1. Stabilization and Immediate Need:** Projects in this category involve work on a failed structural component, such as a frame, foundation, or a leaking roof. Work could also address extensive damage or deterioration over a large portion of the building. For example, a masonry building could require extensive repointing work. A project can also seek to rectify serious ongoing deterioration and damage to significant features of a building, such as structural repairs to a seriously leaning bell tower, relaying of a slate roof, installation of a new metal roof, or sill replacement. Immediate need indicates that without repair of the feature, complete deterioration or failure will happen quickly.

**2. Necessary Repairs, Corrective Measures and Preventive Maintenance:** This category covers projects that restore or repair damaged or deteriorated parts of a building before the deterioration becomes so advanced that the feature must be replaced entirely or before repairs become extremely costly. This can include a single building component or a package of smaller items, which together make up a significant project. It can include corrective measures such as drainage work, or maintenance work such as roof, trim and siding, or porch repair.

**3. Enhancement**: This category consists of work that is not vital to the physical survival of the building, but instead preserves, restores, and enhances features critical to its architectural and/or historical significance. Examples include restoration of decorative interior painting and missing decorative features.

Projects that propose to replace missing architectural features must be supported by documentation (photographs, architectural drawings, on-site physical evidence) which proves that the missing elements did exist on the project building at an earlier time. This documentation must be submitted as a part of the grant application.

Very few historic buildings appear today as they did when they were first constructed. Rather, most have been added to and changed over time. These changes over time are a significant part of a building’s history and should be recognized and respected. Therefore, funds are generally not granted to projects that propose to remove historic building features, even if they were added after the original construction of the building. If your project includes the removal of historic building features, please discuss your plans with the Division before submitting an application.

Projects in the first category, “Stabilization and Immediate Need”, are usually given higher priority for funding. Projects in the other two categories may be awarded funding in cases where the project will preserve critically important historic features or otherwise significantly influence the continued use and preservation of a building.

Projects which are primarily routine maintenance (e.g. cleaning, painting, etc.) will ***not*** be given high priority. Painting is generally considered to be routine maintenance. If a grant request does include painting, the applicant must explain any need for associated preparatory work prior to painting in the application. For example, preparatory work includes any necessary repair to wood damaged through paint failure.

Please keep in mind that this grant program is for restoration work and limited resources preclude funding any “improvements” even if they are important to the use of the building.The types of work described above are examples and do not preclude consideration of other work that meets the intent of one of the three categories.

**Note: Repair is preferable to replacement**. If replacement is required, it is almost always best to use the same type of material. Only in extreme cases will projects utilizing non-historic materials be considered. Substitute materials may be considered if they are compatible with the historic materials in appearance and physical properties, and if they meet performance expectations over a long period of time.

**Temporary repairs** will be funded only under extraordinary circumstances. Applicants who propose temporary repairs must include a written outline which describes how and when permanent repairs will be undertaken, and how and when funding will be obtained.

Criterion 5: **PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO PROJECTS THAT PROMOTE THE BEST LONG-TERM USE OF THE PROPERTY (2 points possible)**

The preservation of a historic property is more likely to be ensured if the current or proposed use does not require substantial changes to its architectural design or historic character. Property owners are encouraged to have a well-defined plan for routine maintenance and long-term preservation of the building and include those plans in the application.

Criterion 6: **PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO BUILDINGS THAT PROVIDE GREATEST BENEFIT TO THE PUBLIC (4 points possible)**

One of the purposes of this program is to promote Vermont's heritage to the public. Public benefit can mean but is not limited to:

 A. the building is regularly open to and used by the public;

 B. the building is easily visible to the public from public places;

 C. the building is especially important in the history of the community;

 D. the building is an important community symbol or local landmark; or

 E. the building is an important example of a building type or architectural style.

Criterion 7: **PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO APPLICANTS WHO PROVIDE A WELL-PLANNED BUDGET FOR THE PROJECT AND DEMONSTRATE A GREATER FINANCIAL NEED (2 points possible)**

Your application may be awarded one (1) point based on descriptions of the proposed work and the estimated project costs you provide, indicating you have considered the full scope of the project and your project budget is based on solid cost projections. Get a detailed written estimate for the work you’re proposing to undertake from a contractor. Be sure the contractor understands that the project must meet the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation* (see Appendix 4 for additional information). Those applicants who can clearly show a greater financial need will be awarded one (1) point in the selection process. This point will only be awarded to applicants who make a strong case for financial need.

**Each project can receive a single point for Criteria 8 through 10:**

Criterion 8: **PRIORITY FOR FUNDING WILL BE GIVEN TO FACILITIES THAT ARE ACCESSIBLE TO PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES OR THAT HAVE PROGRAMS THAT ARE ACCESSIBLE (1 point possible)**

Criterion 9: **PRIORITY WILL BE GIVEN TO APPLICANTS WHOSE PROJECT IS LOCATED IN A DESIGNATED DOWNTOWN OR VILLAGE CENTER (1 point possible)**

This designation is a process established in the Downtown Development Act. In order to receive the one (1) point, the downtown or village center must be officially designated prior to the date when the Advisory Council awards the grants and the building must be within the boundary of the downtown or village center.

Criterion 10: **GEOGRAPHIC DISTRIBUTION MAY BE CONSIDERED AS A FACTOR IN PROJECT SELECTION (1 point possible)**

In an attempt to promote Vermont's heritage to as wide an audience as possible, the geographic distribution of applications will be considered. Geographic distribution will become a selection factor in instances where applications compete equally in the first nine criteria. Points will be given in this category following initial scoring if need to break a tie.